

# **Linking Anti-trust laws with industrial development: Highlighting the prevalence of Anti-trust laws within the Indonesian manufacturing sector**

*M. Afif Hasbullah*

Universitas Islam Darul Ulum, Lamongan, Indonesia

**International Journal of Criminal Justice Science Vol 17 Issue 1 January – June  
2022**

- Pendaftaran akun ke jurnal: 03 December 2021: [IJCJS] [Confirmation Required]  
Notification about your account creation at ManuscriptLink
- Submit Paper: 06 December 2021; [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new  
manuscript submission.
- Keputusan Editor: 08 December 2021; [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new  
manuscript submission
- Keputusan Editor: 04 February 2022: [IJCJS] Editor Decision
- Submit Revisi: 15 Maret 2022: [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision  
submission
- Keputusan Editor: 11 April 2022: [IJCJS] Editor Decision
- Submit Revisi: 29 April 2022: [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision  
submission
- Keputusan Editor: 16 May 2022: [IJCJS] Editor Decision



M. Afif Hasbullah <afif@unisda.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] [Confirmation Required] Notification about your account creation at ManuscriptLink

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>  
To: M. Afif Hasbullah <[afif@unisda.ac.id](mailto:afif@unisda.ac.id)>

Fri, Dec 03, 2021, at 11:34 AM

Dear Dr. M. Afif Hasbullah,

This mail is to let you know that your account (Signin ID: [afif@unisda.ac.id](mailto:afif@unisda.ac.id)) was created at the online manuscript submission and peer-review system of *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

[NOTE] Before starting to use ManuscriptLink service, you need to confirm your email address (signin ID) by clicking the link below:

<https://www.manuscriptlink.com/user/confirm/1e3514eb9fa24d43bba7f2e10153d7l8>

Through the following link, you can access the online manuscript submission and peer-review system of *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs?id=hafsah@uinsu.ac.id>

In the ManuscriptLink online system,

\* If you are an author of manuscript, you can submit a manuscript and keep a close watch over the on-going review process including the review history of past manuscripts.

\* If you are a manager of a journal, you can create and manage a new journal submission and review service, and customize your service according to the demand of editorial members.

\* If you are an editorial member of a journal, you can manage a review process for a submitted manuscript and enhance the academic value of the journal by accepting or rejecting publication of submitted manuscripts.

\* If you are a reviewer of a journal, you can evaluate a submitted manuscript and send your review report to editorial members of the journal.

Best regards,

ManuscriptLink Support Team  
Email: [support@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:support@manuscriptlink.com)  
<https://www.manuscriptlink.com>

Terms of Service and Privacy Policy

Terms of Service : <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/docs/termsOfService>

Privacy Policy: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/docs/privacyPolicy>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.  
Please do not reply to this mail.



M. Afif Hasbullah <afif@unisda.ac.id>

## IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)  
To: M. Afif Hasbullah <[afif@unisda.ac.id](mailto:afif@unisda.ac.id)>

Mon, Dec 06, 2021, at 01:20 PM

Dear Dr. M. Afif Hasbullah,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Linking Anti-trust laws with industrial development: Highlighting the prevalence of Anti-trust laws within the Indonesian manufacturing sector

Author(s): M. Afif Hasbullah

Corresponding Author: M. Afif Hasbullah

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Darul Ulum, Lamongan, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 06-Dec-2021 (UTC)

In a couple of days, a confirmation email including the manuscript ID will be again forwarded to you when the journal manager looks through your submission and confirms it. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.  
Please do not reply to this mail.



M. Afif Hasbullah <afif@unisda.ac.id>

---

## [IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

---

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>

Wed, Dec 08, 2021, at 10:25 AM

To: M. Afif Hasbullah <[afif@unisda.ac.id](mailto:afif@unisda.ac.id)>

Dear Dr. M. Afif Hasbullah,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Linking Anti-trust laws with industrial development: Highlighting the prevalence of Anti-trust laws within the Indonesian manufacturing sector

Author(s): M. Afif Hasbullah

Corresponding Author: M. Afif Hasbullah

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Darul Ulum, Lamongan, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 06-Dec-2021 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-541-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



M. Afif Hasbullah <afif@unisda.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>  
To: M. Afif Hasbullah <[afif@unisda.ac.id](mailto:afif@unisda.ac.id)>

Fri, Feb 04, 2022, at 01:15 PM

Dear Dr. M. Afif Hasbullah,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, " Linking Anti-trust laws with industrial development: Highlighting the prevalence of Anti-trust laws within the Indonesian manufacturing sector ".

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*  
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====  
This email is only for the delivery service.  
Please do not reply to this mail

---

### Reviewer- A

#### Decision: Major revisions required

Overall, the article provides a brief overview of the manufacturing sector in Indonesia and the prevalence of illegal practices in the industry, which has led to the development and implementation of anti-trust laws. The article also highlights the role of the Supervisory Commission on Business Competition (KPPU) in enforcing the laws and imposing administrative sanctions on violators. However, the article lacks depth and detail in several areas. For instance,

1. It does not provide specific examples of illegal practices in the manufacturing sector or the impact of anti-trust laws on the sector's economic growth. Moreover, the article could benefit from a more comprehensive review of the literature on anti-trust laws in Indonesia's manufacturing sector and their effectiveness in promoting fair competition. In terms of

organization, the article could benefit from a clearer structure and more concise language. Additionally, the article would benefit from a more critical analysis of the limitations and potential biases in the data and sources used with a more comprehensive and critical analysis of the topic.

2. The literature review presented provides a comprehensive overview of the concept of anti-trust laws and their impact on industrial development. The review highlights the importance of anti-trust laws in promoting competition, preventing the formation of monopolies, and prohibiting any illegal practices such as price fixing and collusion. The review also emphasizes the importance of anti-trust laws in promoting industrial development, both in developed and developing countries. It highlights how anti-trust laws have effectively prevented big rigging and promoted equal opportunities for all companies in the market, leading to improved productivity and economic growth. In addition to this, the review can also provide an example of how the enactment of UULPM in 2000 in Indonesia has proven efficient in promoting fair competition between different firms and improving their GDP. It can also discuss the various acts that have been effective in setting the ground for anti-trust regulations, including the Sherman Act, the Clayton Act, and the Federal Trade Commission Act.
3. In the discussion section, the given text provides a historical background of the anti-monopoly law in Indonesia, its association with the German government, and the Indonesian Competition Law practices. The text seems to be well-researched, providing a comprehensive overview of the topic. However, there are some areas that could be improved.
  - Firstly, the text could benefit from a clearer structure, such as breaking it into sections with subheadings. This would make navigating and locating specific information easier for the reader.
  - Secondly, while the text provides detailed information, it lacks critical analysis and interpretation. The author could provide a more critical review of the anti-monopoly law and its effectiveness in promoting fair competition in Indonesia.
  - Additionally, the text does not provide any references or citations to support the claims made. It is important to provide sources to support the arguments and increase the text's credibility.
4. The study must highlight the importance of promoting fair competition and prohibiting illegal activities in the manufacturing sector to achieve economic growth. The research should also discuss the prevalence of anti-trust laws in Indonesia and the challenges the government faces in implementing them.
5. The study should provide practical implications for policymakers, government officials, and manufacturing firms to promote the development and implementation of anti-trust policies and regulations. The article should also suggest future research directions to address limitations and biases in the current study, such as exploring anti-trust laws in different industrial sectors in different countries.
6. Finally, the text could benefit from a conclusion summarising the main points and providing some final thoughts on the topic.

---

**Reviewer -B**

**Decision: Major revisions required**

This article submitted to the International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences aims to explore the relationship between anti-trust laws and industrial development in Indonesia, particularly in the

manufacturing sector. The study highlights the prevalence of anti-trust laws within the Indonesian manufacturing sector, the rise of illegal activities, and the development of law no. 5 regarding the "Prohibition of Monopolistic Practices and Unfair Business Competition" (UULPM) in 1999 to promote fair competition among competitors. Overall, the article provides a well-written and informative account of the relationship between anti-trust laws and industrial development in Indonesia. It highlights the importance of anti-trust laws and their role in promoting fair competition between businesses, particularly in the manufacturing sector, which is a significant contributor to Indonesia's GDP. The article also provides a comprehensive overview of the development of law no. 5 regarding the "Prohibition of Monopolistic Practices and Unfair Business Competition" (UULPM) and the role of the KPPU in implementing this legislation.

- A. However, the article could have been strengthened by providing more empirical evidence to support the claims made by the author. The authors can summarise different cases of illegal activities observed in 2020 in Indonesia in different businesses. Additionally, the authors should highlight the need for the KPPU to be provided with more authority and resources to ensure the implementation of anti-monopoly law.
- B. Overall, the article is informative and well-written, providing valuable insights into the relationship between anti-trust laws and industrial development in Indonesia. However, further empirical evidence and detailed recommendations could have strengthened the argument.
- C. The authors may emphasize in discussing the Indonesian government's focus on the policies that must be implemented to ensure assistance from the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and develop a strategy to promote structural reforms.
- D. Authors must refer to the agreement signed between the Indonesian and German governments in August 1998, which was effective in supporting the drafting procedure and implementation of the Anti-monopoly law in Indonesia. The operational support was provided by a German Technical Assistance Agency known as Gesellschaft fuer Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ).
- E. Additionally, the authors must highlight how support from other international organizations such as the World Bank, Ausaid, CISA, and USAID effectively provided technical and financial resources for the Indonesian government to ensure the establishment and implementation of an effective Anti-monopoly law in the country.
- F. The article concludes with recommendations for the KPPU to be provided with more authority and resources to ensure the implementation of anti-monopoly law in the manufacturing sector in Indonesia to promote fair competition between the firms resulting in the economic and industrial development of the country.



M. Afif Hasbullah <afif@unisda.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>

Tue, Mar 15, 2022, at 03:10 PM

To: M. Afif Hasbullah <[afif@unisda.ac.id](mailto:afif@unisda.ac.id)>

Dear Dr. M. Afif Hasbullah,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Linking Anti-trust laws with industrial development: Highlighting the prevalence of Anti-trust laws within the Indonesian manufacturing sector

Author(s): M. Afif Hasbullah

Corresponding Author: M. Afif Hasbullah

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Darul Ulum, Lamongan, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 06-Dec-2021 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-541-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your revision submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.





M. Afif Hasbullah <afif@unisda.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>  
To: M. Afif Hasbullah <[afif@unisda.ac.id](mailto:afif@unisda.ac.id)>

Mon, April 11, 2022, at 11:21 AM

Dear Dr. M. Afif Hasbullah,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, " Linking Anti-trust laws with industrial development: Highlighting the prevalence of Anti-trust laws within the Indonesian manufacturing sector."

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Please revise your manuscript based on the reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month.

Let me know if you have any questions.

Best

Journal Editor-in-Chief  
*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*  
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>



**IJCJS-541-2022\_review.docx**  
15Kb

=====[Note]=====  
This email is only for the delivery service.  
Please do not reply to this mail

-----



M. Afif Hasbullah <afif@unisda.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>  
To: M. Afif Hasbullah <[afif@unisda.ac.id](mailto:afif@unisda.ac.id)>

Fri, April 29, 2022, at 11:32 AM

Dear Dr. M. Afif Hasbullah,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Linking Anti-trust laws with industrial development: Highlighting the prevalence of Anti-trust laws within the Indonesian manufacturing sector

Author(s): M. Afif Hasbullah

Corresponding Author: M. Afif Hasbullah

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Darul Ulum, Lamongan, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 06-Dec-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-541-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission revision for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



M. Afif Hasbullah <afif@unisda.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>  
To: M. Afif Hasbullah <[afif@unisda.ac.id](mailto:afif@unisda.ac.id)>

Mon, May 16, 2022, at 10:55 AM

Dear Dr. M. Afif Hasbullah,

Congratulations! the following of your manuscript.

Track: Regular Track

Linking Anti-trust laws with industrial development: Highlighting the prevalence of Anti-trust laws within the Indonesian manufacturing sector

Author(s): M. Afif Hasbullah

Corresponding Author: M. Afif Hasbullah

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Islam Darul Ulum, Lamongan, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 06-Dec-2021 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-541-2022

Has been accepted for publication in *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences* (Vol. 17 No. 1, 2022). Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on.

We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.

## Revisi Pertama

### RESPONSE TO REVIEWER-A

Sr. #	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	<p>Overall, the article provides a brief overview of the manufacturing sector in Indonesia and the prevalence of illegal practices in the industry, which has led to the development and implementation of anti-trust laws. The article also highlights the role of the Supervisory Commission on Business Competition (KPPU) in enforcing the laws and imposing administrative sanctions on violators. However, the article lacks depth and detail in several areas. For instance,</p>	<p>Thanks very much, dear reviewer, for your kind consideration, remarks, and suggestions.</p>
1	<p>It does not provide specific examples of illegal practices in the manufacturing sector or the impact of anti-trust laws on the sector's economic growth. Moreover, the article could benefit from a more comprehensive review of the literature on anti-trust laws in Indonesia's manufacturing sector and their effectiveness in promoting fair competition. In terms of organization, the article could benefit from a clearer structure and more concise language. Additionally, the article would benefit from a more critical analysis of the limitations and potential biases in the data and sources used with a more comprehensive and critical analysis of the topic.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind comments.</p> <p>I have added specific examples of illegal practices in the manufacturing sector or the impact of anti-trust laws on the sector's economic growth and conducted a more comprehensive review of the literature on anti-trust laws in Indonesia's manufacturing sector and their effectiveness in promoting fair competition.</p> <p>Also added critical analysis of the limitations and potential biases in the data and sources used with a more</p>

		<p>comprehensive and critical analysis of the topic.</p> <p>Please see pages 2-6</p>
2.	<p>The literature review presented provides a comprehensive overview of the concept of anti-trust laws and their impact on industrial development. The review highlights the importance of anti-trust laws in promoting competition, preventing the formation of monopolies, and prohibiting any illegal practices such as price fixing and collusion. The review also emphasizes the importance of anti-trust laws in promoting industrial development, both in developed and developing countries. It highlights how anti-trust laws have effectively prevented big rigging and promoted equal opportunities for all companies in the market, leading to improved productivity and economic growth. In addition to this, the review can also provide an example of how the enactment of UULPM in 2000 in Indonesia has proven efficient in promoting fair competition between different firms and improving their GDP. It can also discuss the various acts that have been effective in setting the ground for anti-trust regulations, including the Sherman Act, the Clayton Act, and the Federal Trade Commission Act.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, Many thanks for your kind comments. Done as suggested</p> <p>Please see pages 6-12</p>

3.	<p>In the discussion section, the given text provides a historical background of the anti-monopoly law in Indonesia, its association with the German government, and the Indonesian Competition Law practices. The text seems to be well-researched, providing a comprehensive overview of the topic. However, there are some areas that could be improved.</p> <p>The author should also mention and explain Articles 263, 264, and 266 of the Firstly, the text could benefit from a clearer structure, such as breaking it into sections with subheadings. This would make navigating and locating specific information easier for the reader.</p> <p>Secondly, while the text provides detailed information, it lacks critical analysis and interpretation. The author could provide a more critical review of the anti-monopoly law and its effectiveness in promoting fair competition in Indonesia.</p> <p>Additionally, the text does not provide any references or citations to support the claims made. It is important to provide sources to support the arguments and increase the text's credibility.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, I revised the complete discussion section and added the required details.</p> <p>Please see pages 11-17</p>
----	--	---

4.	The study must highlight the importance of promoting fair competition and prohibiting illegal activities in the manufacturing sector to achieve economic growth. The research should also discuss the prevalence of anti-trust laws in Indonesia and the challenges the government faces in implementing them.	Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, done as suggested. Please see page 17
5.	The study should provide practical implications for policymakers, government officials, and manufacturing firms to promote the development and implementation of anti-trust policies and regulations. The article should also suggest future research directions to address limitations and biases in the current study, such as exploring anti-trust laws in different industrial sectors in different countries.	Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, done as suggested. Please see pages 19-21
6.	Finally, the text could benefit from a conclusion summarizing the main points and providing some final thoughts on the topic.	Done, dear reviewer. Please see pages 19

#### RESPONSE TO REVIEWER-B

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	This article submitted to the International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences aims to explore the relationship between anti-trust laws and industrial development in Indonesia, particularly in the manufacturing sector. The study highlights the prevalence of anti-trust	Thanks a lot, dear reviewer. I am very grateful for all the valid and valuable comments in improving the paper's quality.

	<p>laws within the Indonesian manufacturing sector, the rise of illegal activities, and the development of law no. 5 regarding the "Prohibition of Monopolistic Practices and Unfair Business Competition" (UULPM) in 1999 to promote fair competition among competitors. Overall, the article provides a well-written and informative account of the relationship between anti-trust laws and industrial development in Indonesia. It highlights the importance of anti-trust laws and their role in promoting fair competition between businesses, particularly in the manufacturing sector, which is a significant contributor to Indonesia's GDP. The article also provides a comprehensive overview of the development of law no. 5 regarding the "Prohibition of Monopolistic Practices and Unfair Business Competition" (UULPM) and the role of the KPPU in implementing this legislation.</p>	
1.	<p>However, the article could have been strengthened by providing more empirical evidence to support the claims made by the author. The authors can summarise different cases of illegal activities observed in 2020 in Indonesia in different businesses. Additionally, the authors should highlight the need for the KPPU to be provided with more</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, I have revised the introduction by providing more empirical evidence to support the claims made by the author. I have also summarised different cases of illegal activities observed in 2020 in Indonesia in different businesses and highlighted the need for the KPPU with more authority and resources to ensure the implementation of anti-monopoly law.</p>



	authority and resources to ensure the implementation of anti-monopoly law.	Please see pages 2-6
2.	Overall, the article is informative and well-written, providing valuable insights into the relationship between anti-trust laws and industrial development in Indonesia. However, further empirical evidence and detailed recommendations could have strengthened the argument.	Done, Dear reviewer, as per your kind suggestion. Please see pages 7-10
3.	The authors may emphasize in discussing the Indonesian government's focus on the policies that must be implemented to ensure assistance from the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and develop a strategy to promote structural reforms.	Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see pages 8-9
4	Authors must refer to the agreement signed between the Indonesian and German governments in August 1998, which was effective in supporting the drafting procedure and implementation of the Anti-monopoly law in Indonesia. The operational support was provided by a German Technical Assistance Agency known as Gesellschaft fuer Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ).	Dear reviewer, many thanks. Following your kind guidelines, done. Please see page 13
5	Additionally, the authors must highlight how support from other international organizations such as the World Bank, Ausaid, CISA, and USAID effectively provided technical and financial resources for the Indonesian	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind guidelines. I have now highlighted how support from other international organizations such as the World Bank, Ausaid, CISA, and USAID effectively

	government to ensure the establishment and implementation of an effective Anti-monopoly law in the country.	provided technical and financial resources for the Indonesian government to ensure the establishment and implementation of an effective Anti-monopoly law in the country. Please see pages 15-17
6	The article concludes with recommendations for the KPPU to be provided with more authority and resources to ensure the implementation of anti-monopoly law in the manufacturing sector in Indonesia to promote fair competition between the firms resulting in the economic and industrial development of the country.	Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see pages 19-21

## Revisi Kedua

### RESPONSE TO REVIEWER

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	The considerable effort of the authors while revising the original draft has led to a minor revision as follows.	Thank you, dear reviewer, for your kind consideration.
1.	The revised text provides a good historical background of the anti-monopoly law in Indonesia and its association with the German government. However, further empirical evidence and more detailed recommendations could have strengthened the argument further.	Dear reviewer, Following your kind instructions, empirical evidence and more detailed recommendations have been provided to strengthen the argument further. Please see page 4
2	The author/authors have well discussed the role of competition policy in promoting government policies that encourage competition among the producers. They should elaborate more on the anti-monopoly law as part of ICL to promote anti-competitive strategies in the business world.	Dear reviewer, Following your kind instructions, we have elaborated more on the anti-monopoly law as part of ICL to promote anti-competitive strategies in the business world. Please see page 7
3	Additionally, the article could have discussed the effectiveness and challenges faced by the Indonesian government in implementing anti-monopoly laws in the country.	Dear reviewer followed your kind instructions and discussed the effectiveness and challenges faced by the Indonesian government in implementing anti-monopoly laws in the country. Please see page 15